



שביעי של פסח
שבת אחרון של פסח
ניסן תשפ"ב



In this Edition

Making Gebrochts on Shevii Shel Pesach
when the last day of Pesach
falls on Shabbos

Making Gebrochts on Shevii Shel Pesach when the last day of Pesach falls on Shabbos

Rabbi Yonason Johnson

The custom of not eating Gebrochts

Many Jews, particularly Chassidim, observe the Minhag of not eat Gebrochts during Pesach. Gebrochts refers to Matzah which has become wet with water. In Lashon Hakodesh wet Matzah is referred to as Sheruya (soaked).

Those who keep this Minhag are concerned that some flour which was not kneaded properly into the dough, may remain on the surface of the Matzah and may not be fully baked. Exposing this flour to water could create Chametz¹.

Yet, even those who are careful with Sheruya throughout Pesach will eat Gebrochts on the 8th day of Pesach – the last day of Yomtov in Chutz Laaretz.

The reason for leniency on Acharon Shel Pesach is because the extra day of Pesach observed in Chutz Laaretz is a Rabbinic observance (as opposed to the first 7 days which are Biblically observed). Therefore in Halocha we have more scope for leniency.

In his Teshuvah on the Chumra of Sheruya, the Alter Rebbe rules that "one who is lenient on the final day of Pesach for the sake of Simchas Yomtov (rejoicing on the festival) does not lose out (on having kept the stringencies of Pesach)".

Not only is Sheruya permitted on the last day of Pesach (for those who refrain during the rest of Yomtov), it is also a custom of great mystical significance, the Chabad Rebbes were Mehader and would intentionally dip their Matzah into all of the different foods and beverages served².

In Eretz Yisroel there is no leniency on Pesach for those who "keep Gebrochts" since all 7 days of Yomtov are Biblical in nature.

When the last day of Pesach falls on Shabbos

The Kevius of Pesach this year gives rise to an interesting and practical Shaalah. This year, the first and eighth and final day of Pesach fall on Shabbos. When Acharon Shel Pesach falls on Shabbos, there is no problem in dipping Matzah into water, but what about eating Kneidelach and other cooked Gebrochts foods which cannot be cooked on Shabbos?

When the second or last day of Yomtov falls on Shabbos, or when Yomtov leads into Shabbos, Shabbos food can be cooked on Erev Shabbos for Shabbos, provided one has made an Eiruv Tavshilin and subject to the Halachos of Eiruv Tavshilin.

If one did make an Eiruv Tavshilin, can they make Kneidelach on Friday, the seventh day of Pesach to eat on Shabbos Acharon Shel Pesach?

To answer this question, there are a number of issues that need to be addressed.

Firstly, even though the Gebrochts will not be eaten until the next day, is the making of Gebrochts on the seventh day of Pesach (when Chametz is still biblically forbidden) problematic because of the concern of a Chashash Chametz?

From the Halachic literature on the topic, it seems that the Poskim do not see this as a concern³.

The main issue raised by the Poskim is that if one may not eat the food that is being cooked on Friday which is Yomtov, are they permitted to cook it to eat on Shabbos?

The same Shaalah applies in Eretz Yisroel where they only celebrate Pesach for 7 days; can one make Gebrochts on Friday to eat on Shabbos when it will no longer be Pesach⁴?

A similar Shaalah arises in Eretz Yisroel with regards to Kitniyos when the seventh and final

day of Pesach falls on Friday and the following day, Shabbos, is no longer Pesach.

Ashkenazim do not eat Kitniyos during Pesach. Unlike Chametz which must be sold, Kitniyos need not be sold. One can keep it and even benefit from it during Pesach, as long as it is not consumed.

In such a Kevius, may an Ashkenazi Jew in Eretz Yisroel cook rice or beans (in a separate designated Kitniyos pot) on Friday to eat on Shabbos when it is no longer Pesach?

The principal of "Ho'il"

The rationale behind this question is that an Eiruv Tavshilin only works in a situation where the food that is being cooked will be ready to eat and could theoretically be given to guests on Yomtov while it is still Friday⁵. This principal is referred to as "Ho'il" literally meaning 'since' (guests may arrive who could of the food on Yomtov itself).

If the food being cooked cannot even theoretically be eaten of Shevii Shel Pesach, for example if it will not be fully cooked before Shabbos comes in, the cooking is a Biblical violation.

So the question here is if one does not eat Kitniyos or Gebrochts on Shevii Shel Pesach and are therefore unable to eat the Gebrochts or Kitniyos on the day that they are being prepared, do we lose the element of "Ho'il", making the cooking on Shevii Shel Pesach for Shabbos forbidden?

Cooking on Yomtov when one will not eat

In addressing this Shaalah, the Poskim quote the ruling of the Ram"o⁶ that one who is fasting may not cook on Yomtov to eat on Shabbos - either for themselves or for others and even when an Eiruv Tavshilin was made.

The weekly Halacha analysis

The Acharonim⁷ question this ruling of the Ram"o;

Based on the principle of "Ho'il", the one who is cooking does not need to be able to eat from the food. It is sufficient that guest would be able to come and that they would partake of the food. If so, even if the person cooking is fasting and unable to eat from the food, it is still possible to theoretically serve it to others or guests who are not fasting. If so, why can the fasting individual not cook for themselves for Shabbos?

The majority of Acharonim⁸ concur with the Ramo's ruling and bring it Lehalacha. How do they address the question raised by those who argue with the Ram"o?

The Alter Rebbe⁹ explains that since this person cannot eat on Yomtov, the Heter of cooking on Yomtov does not apply to him. If so, for him, cooking remains Biblically¹⁰ forbidden on Yomtov. Therefore it is forbidden for him to cook at all for others on Yomtov. Since for him cooking on Yomtov is forbidden (Biblically), he may not cook for himself (or others) for Shabbos. The Eiruv Tavshilin which is only a Rabbinic mechanism does not help to circumvent this concern¹¹.

Making Kitniyos on Shevii Shel Pesach in Eretz Yisroel

If the reason one who is fasting cannot cook on Yomtov for Shabbos is because they cannot eat the food on Yomtov, the same should apply to an Ashkenazi making Kitniyos on Friday when one does not eat those foods.

However, the Poskim distinguish between the cases. The Ram"o discusses one who is fasting and will not eat any foods on Friday, therefore he does not have the Heter of cooking on Yomtov at all. When a person is only not eating certain foods on the Friday of Yomtov (such as Kitniyos), but they do eat other foods, they do have the Heter of cooking of Yomtov.

Therefore they may cook any foods (even those foods that they do not eat) to eat on Shabbos relying on the Eiruv Tavshilin. Even though they will not be eating these foods on Friday, they could be theoretically served to guests who do eat these foods such as a Sefardi or a Choleh¹².

Other Poskim rule that one may not be lenient in the case of Kitniyos¹³. They reason that where the food is not eaten because of a Din or Minhag from the Rishonim, we do not say Ho'il i.e. that we can theoretically serve the food on Yomtov to someone who will eat it¹⁴.

There is also a concern that one may come to eat the Kitniyos food while they are preparing it¹⁵.

Making Gebrochts on Shevii Shel Pesach for Shabbos

Even according to the Poskim who are strict concerning Kitniyos, making Gebrochts may be permitted¹⁶. Unlike Kitniyos which is a Minhag Rishonim and is observed by all Ashkenazi communities, Gebrochts is a relatively recent Chumra which is not widely observed.

Since many Jews (both Ashkenazim and Sefardim) do eat Gebrochts during Pesach, the principle of Ho'il (that it could theoretically served to guests who do eat Gebrochts) can be applied, even when the one making the Gebrochts foods will not eat them on Friday¹⁷.

The Poskim write that we need not be concerned that one may inadvertently come to eat from the Gebrochts while they are preparing them. Minchas Yitzchak¹⁸ writes that although this would be grounds to be Machmir for Kitniyos, this is because Kitniyos are forbidden for all Ashkenazi Jews by force of a binding Minhag.

An Ashkenazi who eats Kitniyos on Pesach transgresses the Torah's instruction not to deviate from the words of the sages. They are considered to be Poretz Geder akin to violating the rulings of the sages of the Talmud. Therefore it is appropriate to forbid preparing Kitniyos on Shevii shel Pesach because one may inadvertently eat it.

In contrast Gebrochts is only a Chumra and one that many G-d fearing Jews do not keep it. If so, there is no reason to forbid making Gebrochts on Shevii shel Pesach lest someone come to eat from it on Shevii shel Pesach, because even if they did, there is no technical Issur. This is especially so since the Chumra of Gebrochts is only because of a doubtful concern that unbaked flour may be present.

Nonetheless, the Keilim used for making Gebrochts for use on Shabbos should not be used for anything being made to eat on the Friday.

It has been recorded in the name of Rabbi Leibel Groner¹⁹, the Rebbe's personal secretary, that one year when Pesach fell out on this Kevius, no Kneidelach were prepared for the Rebbe's Yomtov Seudah. The Rebbe expressed his displeasure that Kneidelach had not been prepared²⁰.

It should be noted that there are noted Chabad Poskim²¹ who rule that one may not make Gebrochts on Shevii Shel Pesach for Shabbos, just as one may not cook Kitniyos according to the Poskim quoted above.

One could argue that there is further grounds to be strict with Gebrochts, because the entire concern is a concern of unbaked flour becoming Chametz via contact with water. This would take place on the 7th day of Pesach where owning Chametz is biblically forbidden. (In contrast, there is no concern of Chametz with Kitniyos).

If one has a family Minhag they should certainly follow their family custom. Those who are lenient have a strong basis in Halacha on which to rely.

May we merit the fulfillment of the Ariza"Is assurance that one who is careful to avoid even the tiniest amount of Chametz of Pesach, will not come to sin (inadvertently) throughout the year.

1. See Teshuvah of the Alter Rebbe Siman 6

2. See Likutei Sichos volume 22 page 30

3. Some Poskim suggest that the stringency of Sheruya throughout Pesach applies to the eating of Gebrochts not the making of Gebrochts. However the Teshuvah of the Alter Rebbe seems to view even the making of Gebrochts as problematic.

4. Since the Alter Rebbe connects the leniency on the last day of Pesach to Simchas Yomtov, there are those who do not allow a Ben Eretz Yisroel to make Gebrochts on the seventh day of Pesach to eat on Shabbos, since on Shabbos there is no Mitzvah of Simcha.

5. This is because cooking on Yomtov for Shabbos is Biblically forbidden. If guests could even theoretically be able to eat this food on Friday itself, it is Biblically permitted. Nonetheless, Chaza"l forbade

one to do this unless they have made an Eiruv Tavshilin. This is accepted Lehalacha and quoted by the Alter Rebbe. If the food is not ready to be eaten on Yomtov, the cooking for Shabbos on Yomtov is a Biblical violation. See Aruch Hashulchan who is Melamed Zechus on those who are not careful to ensure that their food is fully cooked on Erev Shabbos.

6. OC 527:20

7. Mishna Berura 527:65 referencing Elya Rabbah 597

8. Levush (see Elya Zuta who writes that this halacha should be prefaced with Yesh Omrim), Magen Avramag 527:22, Mishna Berura 527:65 and Shulchan Aruch Harav 527:30 and Aruch Hashulchan 33

9. See also Machzitz Hashekel 527:22 and Aruch Hashulchan 33.

10. See Tzlach Beitza 12a

11. The Alter Rebbe adds that his Eiruv Tavshilin does help to enable family members (who are not forbidden from cooking on Yomtov) to cook for him for Shabbos.

12. See Sdeh Chemed erech Chametz umatzah, Luach Eretz Yisroel. See Rabbi Akiva Eiger 1:5 who permits cooking with dried fruits for those who do not them during Pesach, because one could give them a sick individual. See Chasam Sofer OC 79 who argues on this.

13. If the Kitniyos will be cooked by a Sefardi or will definitely be served to a Sefardi on the seventh day of Pesach, Kaf Hachaim 457:16 writes that there is no concern.

14. Daas Torah 527:1, Minchas Yitzchak 7:33

15. Shu"t Halachos Ketanos 1:111, Kinyan Torah 6:27

16. See Minchas Yitzchak 7:33; Chazon Ish 49:15-16 and Nitei Gavriel Vol 3 19:9

17. See however Moadim Uzmanim 7:176 who is still concerned that one may come to eat the Gebrochts while making them.

18. Ibid

19. Otzar Minhagei Chabad Nissan p225, Hiskashrus Volume 45

20. Otzar Minhagei Chabad p. 225. This story was verified by Rabbi Leibel Groner's nephew, Rabbi Chaim Tzvi Groner – Melbourne.

21. Rabbi Levi Bistritzky - Kovetz Tiferes Lamelech. This position is also ascribed to Rabbi Yaakov Landau.