

**KOLLEL IN THE COMMUNITY**

On Monday afternoon Kollel hosted a shiur for a group of 15 young married men who came down from Sydney to spend a few days of Elul learning Torah in Melbourne.

Rabbi Johnson gave a shiur on the Sugya of Eiruv Tavshilin.

Our guests were very impressed by the Kollel and the arrange of activities and shiurim that we offer to the community.

On Thursday morning, Rabbi Johnson was invited to give a shiur to the advanced Limudei Kodesh stream at Yavneh College.

**SAVE THE DATE**

This year's communal **Achdus through Torah** event will take place on the first night of Selichos, Motzai Shabbos Nitzavim-Vayelech Sep 16.

Each year the program has grown, attracting hundreds of fathers and sons from across the Melbourne community, who come to learn in a spirit of Achdus.

Stay tuned for full details.

**TESHUVOS SHIUR**

Is Partners in Torah kosher?  
Learn about the ins and outs of selling one's share in Torah study.  
9:30-10:15am Sunday morning in the Kollel Beis Medrash.

**KOLLEL MINYAN**

Bookings for Yomim Noraim seats in the Kollel Minyan can now be made online.

[www.trybooking.com/ROPT](http://www.trybooking.com/ROPT)

A collection of Torah thoughts produced by Kollel Menachem

אין בית המדרש בלא **חידוש** Chiddush

**In this Edition**

Embracing your despised wife **P.1**

Melting Ice-cream on Shabbos **P.2**

**Embracing your despised wife**

*If a man has two wives, one beloved and the other despised, and they each bear him sons, the beloved one and the despised one, and the first-born son is from the despised one...*

This familiar Mitzvah sounds dramatic; two wives vying for the affection of a common husband and as murphy's law would have it, the first-born son who is entitled to a double portion of the inheritance is born to the wife less cherished.

The Torah and all of its Mitzvos are eternal. But how is it applicable in our lives today, especially considering that polygamy has been forbidden for over one thousand years!

The Alter Rebbe illuminates this Mitzvah in Likkutei Torah by sharing its deeper inner message.

Each one of us possesses two souls; a beloved soul and a despised soul.

The G-dly soul which desires connection to Hashem is beloved. It is the source of our spiritual commitment to devote ourselves to Hashem and fulfil His Mitzvos. From this soul comes our positive G-dly emotions, qualities and characteristics.

The despised wife is our animal soul. This soul vitalise our bodies and is the source of our primal drives and instincts. Whilst this soul too originates from a place of holiness, it descends into this world and into our psyche as the driver of our self-centredness and pursuit of worldly pleasures. From this soul comes our ability to go against Hashem's and our negative emotions and character traits.

These two souls sit in conflict, each relating to life and purpose in completely different terms. This creates an inner struggle and challenge to be holy and spiritual. But it is for this very reason that the G-dly soul comes into this world. Hashem wants the service of both of these souls.

Like the two wives, each one of them produces offspring, spiritual accomplishments.

The offspring of the G-dly soul are our innate acts of holiness and service of Hashem; Learning Torah, Davening and fulfilling the Mitzvos which bind us to

G-d and foster and feed our sense and craving for spirituality. This is the service of the G-dly soul.

The service of the animalistic soul is not as readily apparent. Like the power of the ox ploughing a field, the spiritual service of the animalistic soul comes from harnessing it and transforming its strengths to redirect them from self-centeredness towards a relationship and desire for holiness.

Service of the G-dly soul is more beloved. The sense of spiritual accomplishment and fulfilment through davening and learning comes easier and are more manifest. These activities make us feel more "holy".

But the Torah teaches us that the first-born, the greater and more important achievement comes from the despised wife. It is specifically through working on our animalistic side, to tame its nature and refine its character that our most powerful spiritual accomplishments are achieved.

One great Rabbi commented that it is easier to learn the entire Talmud numerous times, than to change one Middah!

The month of Elul is a month of Teshuvah, spiritual improvement and positive resolutions. We often focus our Teshuvah efforts on the beloved wife; to learn more Torah, to daven with greater Kavanah.

But the despised wife is often neglected, perhaps because of how difficult the task is or because we don't associate or feel how refining our Middos is spiritual. Working on our emotions; anger control, restraining our arrogance and curbing our self-centred desire and narcissism, should be an important part of our Elul program.

This is not to minimise our beloved-wife-resolutions. Torah, Tefillah and Mitzvos are important and should be improved and strengthened during this opportune month. But alongside, with at least as much attention, we must embrace the service of the despised wife too.

Our service of Hashem will then be holistic and all-encompassing, taking us to greater heights as truly spiritual beings and better people too.

# Pouring hot sauce on ice-cream on Shabbos

Rabbi Yonason Johnson

*For dessert this Shabbos I was thinking of serving ice-cream with chocolate sauce. The sauce would be kept warm on the blech and poured over the ice-cream before serving. The sauce would not be Yad Soledes Bo. Is there any problem in serving this?*

## Bishul Issues

The first issue to deal with is the issue of Bishul. If the sauce is *Yad Soledes Bo* (40°C)<sup>1</sup>, there would be an issue of Bishul and it would be forbidden to pour it onto the ice-cream. Even if the ice-cream mixture was previously cooked as part of its production, since it is a moist food, it would be subject to further cooking.

If the sauce is not *Yad Soledes Bo* as you write, it does not have the capacity to cook and poses no issue of Bishul.

There is a stringency brought by the Poskim to always treat a Kli Rishon (the pot that was on the fire) stringently even if the contents are less than *Yad Soledes Bo*. This is to create a *Harchaka* (extra protection) when dealing with a Kli Rishon<sup>2</sup>. Others do not adopt this stringency and apply it only to the Kli Rishon while it is on the fire<sup>3</sup>.

Even according to the stringent approach, the *Chumra* would be limited to putting things into the Kli Rishon. Your situation, which involves pouring from the pot over something else, would not be a problem.

## Melting Solids - Background

Even though there is no issue of Bishul, the fact that the sauce will melt the ice-cream raises another Halachic issue which needs to be explored.

The Gemara<sup>4</sup> rules that on Shabbos one is not allowed to crush ice or snow to make it into liquid. However one may place it into a cup to melt.

Rashi<sup>5</sup> understands the issue to be *Molid* (creating). Transforming ice into water resembles an act of creating. Accordingly, the prohibition is only where one actively makes the liquid through their action e.g. by crushing. Placing the ice in a cup to melt by itself is permissible, even if the cup was empty because no action is involved.

Sefer Haterumah<sup>6</sup> understands the issue to be *Nolad* (a change which brings a new entity into existence). Accordingly, even when the ice melts by itself it would be forbidden. The Gemara permits placing ice into a cup only

where there is liquid in the cup. In this case, since whatever melts will immediately mix with the liquid so that it is not ניכר. There is not an issue of *Nolad*.

The Alter Rebbe<sup>7</sup> based on Rambam<sup>8</sup>, understands the concern as being an extension of the Rabbinic *Gezeira* on liquid that oozes from a fruit. This juice is forbidden to be used even when it flows out by itself lest one come to squeeze the fruits. According to this opinion as well, the *issur* applies even when the ice melts by itself.

## Melting Solids - Practical Application

The Rishonim and Shulchan Aruch discuss how these Halachos apply in other cases which involve melting of solid or congealed substances.

The Shulchan Aruch<sup>9</sup> rules that one is allowed to place food or liquid near a fire at a distance so that it would never reach *Yad Soledes Bo* even if it would be left there for a long time<sup>10</sup>.

Subsequently, the Shulchan Aruch<sup>11</sup> writes that one may put an *Enpanada* (dough filled with pieces of solid fat) near the fire on Shabbos where it will not reach *Yad Soledes Bo*<sup>12</sup>.

The Mechaber, who follows the approach of Rashi, is not concerned because the fat will melt and liquefy by itself. The Ram"o writes that the same is true for a pot which has a congealed sauce that will melt when placed near a fire.

However the Ram"o<sup>13</sup> notes that there are those who are stringent, following the opinions above which are stringent even when the ice melts by itself. The Minhag is to be stringent. Only in a case of real need can one rely on the lenient opinion.

Even according to the Ram"o, the *issur* only applies where a significant amount will ooze out and will be ניכר. If the *Enpanada* is placed sufficiently far so that only a small amount of fat will melt, it is permitted because it will be absorbed in the dough and not recognisable. Even if some of the liquid may ooze out, it will be minimal and is not "*choshuv*"<sup>14</sup>. Fat on top of a soup is considered ניכר when it melts as it will float to the surface<sup>15</sup>.

The above Halachos apply when melting butter and chocolate etc. they also apply to melting ice-cream if it will melt and become a liquid.

If the action will only cause the congealed mass to soften, but essentially remain a solid mass, the *issur* does not apply<sup>16</sup>. Therefore one may leave ice-cream out to soften and may likewise warm the scoop in hot water to soften the ice-

cream and make it easier to serve.

Where one actively causes the congealed substance to melt e.g. crushing ice, even the Mechaber would forbid it and according to all opinions it would be forbidden even *Bedieved*<sup>17</sup>. Pouring hot liquid over a congealed solid is considered as actively causing it to melt<sup>18</sup>.

When one actively causes something to melt, it is questionable whether the leniency of melting only a minimal insignificant amount would apply.

## Conclusion

If the sauce is hot enough that it will melt the ice-cream on contact, this would be forbidden according to all opinions. If the sauce will not melt the ice-cream on contact but rather slowly melt the ice-cream as a result, this is subject to the *Machlokes* between the Mechaber who would allow it and the Ram"o who would prohibit it.

In a case of need one may rely on the lenient opinion. It is difficult to define what type or level of need would be required to permit relying on the lenient view<sup>19</sup>. The Levush<sup>20</sup> writes that one can be lenient for serving guests.

If the sauce is warm enough that it will soften the ice-cream or only melt an insignificant amount that will become a liquid, this is permissible according to all opinions.

1. There is debate amongst the Poskim what temperature *Yad Soledes Bo* is. Opinions range from 40-45°C. Therefore one should be Machmir and be concerned for the lowest measure.
2. Shulchan Aruch Harav 318:17 based on Magen Avraham's (3:18:28) understanding of the Yerushalmi (3:4). This is also the Psak of Eglei Tal. Kaf Hachaim (318:105) writes that one who is stringent is praiseworthy.
3. Elya Rabbah 318:23. Mishna Berura 318:64 is also lenient. See also Biur Hagra
4. 51b
5. This is also the view of Semag, Semak, Rashb"a and Rabbeinu Yerucham
6. This is also the opinion of Ra"n
7. 318:25. See also Mageb Avraham 318:42
8. Shabbos 21:13
9. 318:14.
10. Shulchan Aruch Harav 318:24
11. 318:16
12. The Shulchan Aruch permits this even where it could reach *Yad Soledes Bo*. There is no Bishul involved because the *Enpanada* has already been cooked and is a dry food. Therefore it is not subject to further cooking – אין בישול אחר בישול – ibid
13. Shulchan Aruch Harav 318:26
14. Magen Avraham 318:42
15. Meor Hashabbos 3:13
16. Magen Avraham 318:42
17. For this reason one may not pour hot water onto dirty plates which have congealed fat on them. See Magen Avraham 353:41
18. Unlike other places, the Ram"o does not write צורך גדול which would imply a great need, here he writes במקום הצורך. Obviously this does not mean any need, because one could argue that everything is done for a need.
19. 318:16. The Levush was a Talmid of the Ram"o and presumably understood his intention.